

Contents

Chapter 1 Overview Hitoshi Yoshioka

1. Why do an International Assessment of the Interim Report?	1
1-1 . Events Leading Up to the Formulation of the Draft Nuclear Energy Policy Outline	1
1-2 . Interim Report Concerning the Nuclear Fuel Cycle Policy	1
1-3 . Purpose of the Review	2
2. Organization and Activities of the ICRC	3
2-1. Background behind the establishment of the ICRC	3
2-2. ICRC Members	3
3. Characteristics of and Problems with the Interim Report	4
3-1. Conducting a “Comprehensive Evaluation” of the “Basic Scenarios”	4
3-2. The Conclusion to Adhere to the Current Policy	5
3-3. Problems with the Methodology of the Overall Assessment	5
3-4. Problems with each of the Individual Assessment Items	7
3-5. A Summarization of the Problems	9
4. Results of the Reviews by Overseas Panelists	9
4-1. Overall characteristics	9
4-2. Particular features of each individual report	10
4-2-1. Fred Barker (UK)	10
4-2-2. Mycle Schneider (France)	11
4-2-3. Christian Küppers (Germany)	11
4-2-4. Frank von Hippel (USA)	13
5. Assessment of the Cost of a Change of Policy	13
5-1. Why treat the cost of a change of policy as a separate issue?	13
5-2. The Interim Report’s evaluation methodology in regard to the cost of a change of policy	14
5-3. Errors in the long-term nuclear power plant shut down scenario	14
5-4. The real problem associated with a change of policy	15
5-5. The uncounted costs of not changing policy	16
6. Conclusion	16

Chapter 2 ICRC Review Fred Barker

1. Introduction	18
2. Deficiencies in the Planning Council's Assessment Method	18
3. Key Issues in Judgements of Scenario Performance	19
4. Methods for Improved Assessment	23
5. Stakeholder Participation in Assessment	25
6. Conclusion	26

Chapter 3 ICRC Review Mycle Schneider

1. Introduction	27
2. JAEC Methodology	27
3. Definition of the Scenarios	28
4. Evaluation of the Scenarios	29
5. Conclusion	39

Chapter 4 ICRC Review Christian Küppers

1. Introduction	42
2. Radiological Impact of Reprocessing, Interim Storage and Final Disposal of Spent Fuel	43
3. Safety of Reprocessing, Interim Storage and Final Disposal of Spent Fuel	46
4. Proliferation Risks Related to Separated Plutonium and Spent Fuel	47
5. Overseas trends	49
6. Conclusion	49

Chapter 5 ICRC Review Frank von Hippel

1. Introduction	50
2. Domestic considerations: economics, safety and other considerations	50
3. International considerations: the added danger of plutonium diversion by would-be nuclear terrorists and damage to the effort to contain the proliferation of national nuclear fuel-cycle facilities	52
4. Conclusion	56

Appendix 1: New Nuclear Policy-Planning Council 13th Meeting Reference Paper 1.

Interim Report Concerning the Nuclear Fuel Cycle Policy, 12 November 2004	1
---	---

Appendix 2: Letter to the JAEC Chairman

Appendix 3: Reply from the JAEC Chairman